



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs
Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES~~

Tuesday, November 5, 2013 – OLD BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –5:00 p.m.

Called to order at 5:02 p.m.

Staff in attendance: J. Grieder, HDC Assistant Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Absent Members: Barham, Coombs,

Late Arrivals: Hill-Holdgate 5:09 p.m.

Early Departures: None

Agenda adopted as amended by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

1. Town of Nantucket – 60509	Multiple locations	New signs: freestanding signs	various	Jeff Carlson
2. Ray, Edith – 60510	62 Miacomet Avenue	Color change: roof	67-883	R. Ray
3. Prioco – 60511	6 Swift Rock Road	Replace sunroom	40-34	Link P & D
4. Doran – 60512	15 Monohansett Road	Exterior staircase	79-148	Link P & D
5. China Lake RT – 60513	1 Blackfish Lane	Hardscape	73-104	Atlantic Landscape
6. LaPiene, Joshua – 60514	8 Essex Road	Add to fence	67-340	Self
7. Miles, Helen – 60515	8 Crooked Lane	Re-site Garage	41-208	Twig Perkins
8. Miles, Helen – 60516	8 Crooked Lane	Re-site shed	41-208	Twig Perkins
9. Nantucket Offshore Woods – 60517	7 Windy Way	Porch & window change	67-118.1	Workshop APD
10. Nanahumacke Preserve – 60518	17 Nanahumacke Lane	Change porch to pergola	57-30	Rowland & Assoc
11. Hashim, J. & P – 60519	2 Nichols Road	New egress window & well	92.4-66	Rowland & Assoc
12. Lema, James – 60520	5 Doc Ryder Drive	Roof change	66-211	Valero, Scott
13. Patterson, Neil – 60521	10 Salros Road	Move off (to 42 Bartlett)	67-107	Donald Dimock
14. Auerbach, Herbert – 60522	18 Long Pond Road	Revision to 53916	59-20	R. Goodwin
15. Gammons, Rich Amy – 60523	11 Curlew Court	Revisions to 59882	68-518	BPS Architecture
16. Zeziher, Peter – 60524	34 Shimmo Pond Road	Amend cert	42-124	Permits Plus
17. NHA Properties – 60525	75 Old South Road	Enclosed Stair (addition)	69-999.1	Anne Kuszpa
18. Foley, Thomas – 60526	87 Squam Road	Alterations to studio	13-4.1	Scott Hutton
19. Foley, Thomas – 60527	87 Squam Road	Alterations to main house	13-4.1	Scott Hutton
20. Congleton, William L – 60528	29 Lyons Lane	Pool & hardscape	72-42	Self
21. Graham, Kathryn – 60529	11 Priscilla Lane	Pergola/Gate	41-351	Burr Tupper
22. Salisbury, David – 60530	18 Brant Point Road	Addition	39-152	
23. Whitlock, Henry – 60531	8 Hydrangea Lane	Door	73-88	M. C. Roachat
24. Latshaw/Yoder – 60532	113 Baxter Road	Deck revisions	48-11	Ethan

Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None

Public None

Concerns McLaughlin requested to see Item 4: 15 Monohansett Road – no concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Camp)**

Vote Carried 3-0/McLaughlin abstain

Certificate #

60509 to 60532

III. * CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS**COMMENTS**

1. O'Callaghan – 60533	29 Brewster Rd	due to lack of visibility
2. Hamilton, K. – 60534	79 Somerset Rd	remove the "E" skylight
3. Dolzer, R. – 60535	7A Tom Nevers Rd	remove small half round in gable and can either leave window out or put a four light fixed
4. Rose, Doug – 60536	22 Fair St	TDL French doors
5. Pappendick – 60537	29 Sankaty Rd	due to lack of visibility
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp	
Alternates	None	
Recused	None	
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.	
Representing	None	
Public	None	
Concerns	None	
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per comments. (Camp)	
Vote	Carried 3-0/McLaughlin abstain	Certificate # 60533 to 60537

IV. CIENAVA

1. Cienava, Edmund	Head of Plains	New dwelling revisions	63-65	S. Rocco
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Revised plans presented at the table.			
Representing	Steven Cohen , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP – Reviewed the history of the old application. Presented the new proposal. Would like to get an approval on this project to night; if that is done, there is no need to go forward with the appeal of the past proposal. Believe this is close enough to resolve tonight; will not go forward for revisions. Also incorporated comments from the butter; stated that counsel for the abutter indicated satisfaction with the new design.			
	Steve Rocco , Rocco Architects. – Reviewed changes to this proposal based upon conversations with the Chair. Contends the foundation and basement walkout are not visible. The barrel vaults and fan windows are signature elements of the design that he stated he wants to keep.			
	Edmund Cienava – Wants to use the turret cupola to be able to check the condition of the roof.			
Public	Sarah Alger , Sarah F. Alger P.C., for abutter – At this point satisfied with the design and hope for an approval.			
Concerns	(5:09) Williams – Explained that HDC has seen preliminary plans; this is the new application.			
	Leonardo-Finger – Appreciated the changes; but the cupola is not appropriate. The half-rounds and arch over them are not appropriate. Cap on the chimney is odd. Sidelights in conjunction with half rounds are not appropriate. Still concerned with the height and overall length.			
	McLaughlin – Agree about the half-rounds. The turret configuration is found nowhere on Nantucket in needs to disappear. All four sides are visible from a street or travelled way. West elevation is inappropriate. The band board is inappropriate.			
	Camp – Too large massing for the area. Agree about the turret being out of place. The west elevation one porch on top of the other looks like a hotel. West elevation south end railing should be natural to weather.			
	Hill-Holdgate – The top of turret is a problem, the windows are very large; would be better if it came to a point without windows. The 8-over-1 windows should be 6-over-6 to match the others. There is leeway because of the size of the lot, the distance of visibility and being in Madaket.			
	Williams – Agree with Hill-Holdgate. Caution the board not to go backward on this because of the pending appeal. On the east elevation the 6-lights are inappropriate in the gable. Agree about the trim band going away. The rake is very heavy; needs to be reduced. Would like to see the negative mass get shallower and panes need to be vertical and trim should be removed or reduced. On the south elevation, would like the 2 nd -story porch reduced; would like the deck rails to be shingled since it is a shingle-style house. Remove band on the chimney. Agree with Hill-Holdgate that with some tweaking, the turret will disappear without the top-knot. This house could support a roof walk. The cupola is not appropriate on this structure. The 3 rd floor could support a skylight rather than the cupola. W elevation center the triple ganged windows under the French doors reduced to double ganged. All the French doors should be the same.			
	Review of changes agreeable to both the applicant and HDC: remove the trim bands around both the half-rounds; east elevation, lighten gable trim, 4-lights in the gables, flush rake; south elevation a flush rake and reduce the size of the deck; change turret windows.			
	Discussion about skylights in lieu of the cupola and windows on the turret.			
	Hearing recessed at 5:49			

Reconvened at 6:20 p.m. **Cohen** – Reviewed a solution: cut the cupola in the turret for 3-light shed dormers.
Williams – Never ever 3rd-floor dormers on a gambrel.
Cohen – Agree to windows in turrets turned into 6-light sashes and 2X3 skylights. All trim and doors are natural to weather and terratone window sashes.
McLaughlin – Do not want to see the turret start a precedent on the island will vote against this.
Cohen – Need a vote to withdraw the appeal.

Motion **Motion to incorporate the first file with this new file. (Hill-Holdgate) Carried unanimously**
Motion to Approve through staff with reduced rakes and trim, remove trim over palladium windows on east and west elevations, removed trimband on the west and east elevations, the sidelights on front door to have vertical panes, the decks on the west elevation south wing to be reduced in width by 3 to 4 feet, the west elevation left side triple window to be reduced to a French door and two separate windows, the west elevation connector 1st-floor triple window to be reduce to 2 windows separated, top of chimney to be flush course, French doors all to be 15-light, new window schedule showing Terratone sashes and simulated divided light, all doors and trim natural to weather, windows in turret changed to 6-over-1, and clear glass in top of the turret to be 6-light, two 24X36 vertical skylights, one on the west elevation left of main mass and one center on the west elevation addition left roof, and 3 fixed 4-lights in gable attic, Per Exhibit A. (Hill-Holdgate)

Vote Carried 3-2/McLaughlin & Leonardo-Finger opposed **Certificate # 60539**

Appeal Motion **Motion to postpone the Board of Selectmen appeal to December 11 on both the main house and the cottage. (Hill-Holdgate)**

Vote Carried 3-1/McLaughlin opposed, Leonardo-Finger abstain

2. Cienava, Edmund Head of Plains New 2nd dwelling revisions 63-65 S. Rocco

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Revised plans presented at the table.

Representing **Steven Cohen**, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP
Steve Rocco, Rocco Architects.
Edmund Cienava

Public **Sarah Alger**, Sarah F. Alger P.C., for abutter

Concerns (6:31) Williams – The cottage needs to be put on the agenda

Motion **Motion to postpone the BOS appeal to December 11 on both the main house and the cottage. (Hill-Holdgate)**

Vote Carried 3-1/McLaughlin opposed, Leonardo-Finger abstain **Certificate #**

V. 60-DAY DENIALS

1. None

VI. OLD BUSINESS: VIEW PACKET

1. Bigley, David 20 York Street – HSAB Windows, doors 55.4.1-147 Self

Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing None

Public None

Concerns (5:50) **Hill-Holdgate** – South elevation French door sidelights need to be removed.
Camp – Agree.
Leonardo-Finger – East elevation windows should remain the same size as the rest.
McLaughlin – No comments.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with the elimination of the sidelight on the south elevation French door. (Hill-Holdgate)**

Vote Carried 4-0/Leonardo-Finger abstain **Certificate # 60538**

2.	Yates, Chris	7 New Lane – HSAB	Demo dwelling	41-285	SCI/R. Newman
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<p>Kevin Dale, Vaughan, Dale, Hunter and Beaudette, P.C. – Presented project. Have not been able to find someone to take the structure. Believe with the additions, it does not fit the rubric of contributing.</p> <p>Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction Inc. – Reviewed the condition of the structure, dated 1932 with 1940s additions. Listed as contributing architecturally; unknown historically. Do not believe it can be salvaged.</p> <p>Chris Yates, owner</p>				
Public	None				
Concerns	<p>(5:53) McLaughlin – Do not object to the demolition. Believe it is not architecturally significant.</p> <p>Leonardo-Finger – Concerned about obliterating a generation of structure built on the island. This is indicative of the period and should be protected.</p> <p>Hill-Holdgate – It appear the structure has experienced significant changes since it was constructed that are atypical to the style. Can't ascertain if it is a bungalow or 1940s ranch. Okay with removing it with the proper findings.</p> <p>Camp – Agree with Hill-Holdgate.</p> <p>Williams – Looking at whether or not this is architecturally significant and if it can be moved; do not believe it can be saved. The staircase has been moved at least once. There is a hodge-podge of foundation types. Do not believe it is architecturally or historically significant.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the new dwelling. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	
3.	Yates, Chris	7 New Lane – HSAB	New dwelling	41-285	SCI/R. Newman
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<p>Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction Inc.</p> <p>Kevin Dale, Vaughan, Dale, Hunter and Beaudette, P.C.</p> <p>Chris Yates, owner</p>				
Public	None				
Concerns	<p>(6:09) McLaughlin – It is visible on 3 sides. In the old historic district (OHD), should not have double rafter tails. The deck needs to be reduced back to no more than 8 feet deep; it will be visible from New Lane. The meeting rails need to align. It fits into the neighborhood. There should be a small solid-board fence around the air-conditioning units (A/C).</p> <p>Leonardo-Finger – Too much massing for the neighborhood; massing needs to be simplified and height reduced. West elevation dormer is too large. Agree about the rafter tails and the deck on the rear. Treatment of the chimney is not appropriate.</p> <p>Hill-Holdgate – The proposed should be kept low at 1½ story. This is OHD and windows should be 6-over-6 true divided lights and no exterior chimney mass. Two full stories with flush dormers don't work in this neighborhood. There is enough ground cover for 1-story elements.</p> <p>Camp – Too tall for a bungalow. East elevation, the massing of the three French doors is a concern.</p> <p>Williams – Should be more a bungalow style. The east elevation is completely invisible. Agree about the A/C; it would be better off behind the house. Agree with much that's been said. The 10-foot plate height is too much and should be reduced; that would bring the window sizes down. Windows should be 6-over-6. A bungalow with low eave height is the best route. Gable to the street with shed dormers would work. Agree about the exterior chimney being moved interior.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	

4.	Cressman, Tessa	1 Wauwinet Road	New dwelling	20-11	N. Van Vorst
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Nils Van Vorst – Presented the project. Due to wetlands, the building envelop is small. Trim will be natural to weather and grey doors and “Stone” sashes				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:43) McLaughlin – No comments due to the location. Leonardo-Finger – East elevation left, the French doors don’t show panes; should be 15-light. Need the railings drawn on the balconies. Hill-Holdgate – The roof over the door on the north elevation needs 45 degree brackets.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 15-light French doors and 45-degree bracket on the north elevation door and balusters. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60540	
5.	Saligman, Harvey	117 Eel Point Road	2 nd floor addition	32-01	N. Van Vorst
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Nils Van Vorst – Presented the project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:50) Williams – The cantilevered 2 nd floor living space over the porch will make the deck count as ground cover. Need to check on that ground cover before going forward. McLaughlin – Stated that he would like to review the merits of the project despite the ground cover issues. Thinks it is approvable. Hill-Holdgate – The cantilevered space should not be flush with the edge of the deck.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and further information. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
6.	Sandy Water Realty	6 ½ S. Pasture Lane	New dwelling w/ garage	80-429	T. Clinger
Sitting	McLaughlin (acting chair), Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Williams, Hill-Holdgate				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	None				
Public	Linda Williams , abutter – Spoke in favor of the application.				
Concerns	(6:55) Staff – Read application specifications. Leonardo-Finger – No concerns. Camp – No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Leonardo-Finger)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60541	

Break 7:00 to 7:07 p.m.

7. Dukes 53 LLC	53 Dukes Road	Demo garage/1 st floor addition	56-185.4	Rowland & Assoc
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Mickey Rowland , Rowland and Associates – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:07) McLaughlin – Anything above the 1 st floor is visible. Leonardo-Finger – South elevation, the transom over the ganged window is not appropriate. The front door entry sidelights are not appropriate. The screened porch is not appropriately designed. West elevation, door lights are too narrow and too numerous. East elevation has the same issue; not sure about the 4-over-4 windows on the front. The fire pit needs to come in under a separate application. Camp – The shed roof over the front door is inappropriate and 2 nd -floor ganged windows are excessive. The French doors should be 15 lights. Williams – Nothing being done to this structure is appropriate. All the barn elements are being removed and the proposed details are not appropriate. The floor plan needs to be worked into the existing structure. North elevation, the dormers might be visible. The chimney does not meet code. The deck is too wide. The over-sized windows are not appropriate. Fenestration is chaotic and out of whack. The front is definitely visible.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
	Discussion about Old Business items for which there is no quorum going to Thursday.			
8. Block-Kelley	3 Sherburne Turnpike	Roofwalk skirt	30-114	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:19) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 22. No objections.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 1 ½ inch gaps and natural to weather. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried 4-0/Leonardo-Finger abstain		Certificate #	60542
9. Johnson, Brian	11 Arrowhead Drive	New storage building	69-309	B. Johnson
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Brian Johnson			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:24) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 22. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60543

10. Haub, Christian & L.	57 Eel Point Road	New 2 nd dwelling	32-46	Workshop APD
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan McMorro			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:26) Staff – Read application specifications. Read letter into the record from Diane McLaughlin, 55 Eel Point Road. Hill-Holdgate – West elevation, the open rafter detail on both sides of the floating deck is atypical; full double set of French doors is too heavy for this structure. Pergola should be natural to weather. Structure is too tall and thin and shouldn't have the cross-gable affect. There is an over-use of 4-light awning windows. There is a lot of topography so the visible impact won't be dramatic. Need a sample of the stone and not sure the stone detail exists anywhere else. Camp – The underground garage with the drive down is a concern. Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. McLaughlin – Awning windows should be fixed. Leonardo-Finger – Agree with what's been said. Would like to know what material the outdoor shower is made of. The underground garage is too much. Structure is too thin and too tall. Williams – This structure is not appropriate at all. It violates the 1½-to-1 ratio on two sides. Agree with what's been said. Pergola is too tall. The railing detail is not appropriate.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
11. Canty, Chris	56 Cato Lane	Roof walk change	55-108	Self
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chris Canty – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:35) Staff – Read previous concerns. Williams – Need to remove the banding around the roof walk.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the banding removed from the roof walk. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60544	
12. NHA Properties	75 Old South Road	Solar P/V installation	68-999.1	A.Kuszpa
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Hill-Holdgate			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Anne Kuszpa , Executive Director Nantucket Housing Authority – Presented project. There would be a lot between this structure and the proposed road. Ground mounting the panels is too high a cost. There will be two more structure moved onto the lot and need a total of 16 parking spaces. Zachery Dusseau, Solar designer			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:38) Williams – Stated that the south side might be visible from the new subdivision being developed behind the structure. Leonardo-Finger – There are a lot of panels and concerned that they will be visible. Do not like the black panels on a grey roof. If the 5 panels are centered, would approve if the motion includes the special comment about who they are for. Would like to look at it again to assess the reduced size. McLaughlin – The guidelines suggest ground mounting and there is enough land for ground mounting. Camp – If the panels are pulled off the edge of the roof and the number of panels reduced, would have no concerns. Williams – The panels should be the same color as the roof. If the panel closest to Old South Road were removed, would have no concerns.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

VII. OLD BUSINESS

1. Cribbins	68 Sankaty Ave – SAB	Hardscaping: pool/hardscaping	49-187	Shelter 7
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Jason Olbres , Shelter 7 LLC – Reviewed changes made per concerns from October 10.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:50) No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60545	
2. Osley/Juice Bar	12 Broad Street – HSAB	Modify window changes	42.4.2-73	R. Newman/SCI
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Presented photos of similar items at the table.			
Representing	Robert Newman , Sandcastle Construction Inc. – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	Bill Osley, owner			
Concerns	(7:51) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 10. McLaughlin – It's Fine. Camp – No concerns. Williams – The pent roof should drop 18 inches.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the pent roof dropping 18 inches. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60546	
3. LTS Ginger	5 Blackfish Lane	Revisions: house	73-122	Workshop APD
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan McMorro – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:56) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 01. Leonardo-Finger – Have an issue with the window, still. The little windows in the dormer don't work. The sidelights don't go with this style of the house. The east elevation has too many dormers; there is too much space around the windows and the middle dormer looks too large. Camp – Agree about the dormers, they should be and smaller and fewer. North elevation chimney at the 1 st floor seems too chunky and modern. McLaughlin – The window is not appropriate. The awning windows should be fixed or hopper. East elevation, the dormer set back is not adequate. Williams – South elevation sidelights are not an appropriate style. The 2-over-2 window is not appropriate, should be 6-over-6. Agree that the south elevation left dormer is not appropriate. West elevation window is a no-go. North elevation chimney should be straight or corbelled differently. The 5 French doors are not appropriate. East elevation "G" windows to the right are too big. A/C units are not hidden. Dormers are not working.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

4. LTS Ginger	5 Blackfish Lane	Revisions: shed	73-122	Workshop APD
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan McMorro – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the house. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
5. Kilmartin	11 New Mill St – HSAB	New garage/studio	55.4.4-87	Thornewill
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Reviewed changes.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:04) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 17. Hill-Holdgate – Do not think any of the concerns were addressed. Would like to see the main house. The proposed is way over sized and sits too close to the road. Camp – Don't have as many concerns. Leonardo-Finger – Agree with Hill-Holdgate.			
Motion	McLaughlin – North elevation dormer, if the meeting rails can't align, the fascia board should run all the way across with a 1-foot setback. Casement windows should be hoppers or fixed. Williams – This garage is competing with the existing house and is much too large. The studio should run out the back of the existing garage with the garage moved forward 6 feet. There are not enough votes for this structure. Motion to Approve through staff with the fascia board should run all the way across with a 1-foot setback of the dormer on the S elevation. (McLaughlin) Not carried.			
Vote	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate) Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
6. 26 Gosnold Road NT	26 Gosnold Road	New dwelling	30-189	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed changes per previous concerns on the north and east elevations. Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Willing to reduce the plate height 6 inches and change the north elevation dormers per comments. Sarah Alger , Sarah F. Alger P.C. – Need to get this approved in order to move forward.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:13) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 22. Hill-Holdgate – East elevation, would prefer to see a single window in the dormer to allow for a shutter. North elevation, the rear piece should go back to the shed and be a single door separated. Moving the chimney to the exterior is a mistake. Would like to see the plate height drop. Camp – Agree about east elevation. North elevation, the two rooms with porches seem over fenestrated; agree about reducing the doors. McLaughlin – Window schedules says the “D” windows are awnings. Williams – The 10-foot plate height won't fly in this location; it needs to come down. Okay with the double windows in the front. The north elevation dormers need to have the fenestration reduced; they need to be smaller. The middle dormer should have a door and a window and narrower to come 3 feet off the wall plane. The other should go back to a shed dormer.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the plate height reduced 6 inches, north elevation middle dormer reduced to 1 door and 1 window unganged, right dormer reduced to one door and two separated windows. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60547

7. Maxey Pond LLC	9 Maxey Pond Road	Change railings	40-103	Rowland & Assoc
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
8. Goldberg	156 Orange Street	New decks/revise fenestration	55-61	Emeritus
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
9. Fogerty, Brian	19 Masaquet	New dwelling	80-140	Emeritus
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
10. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	New dwelling	30-193	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Provided alternate option at the table.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Option C.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:27) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 3.			
	Camp – The design with Option C is appropriate.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions per Option C. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
11. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	New garage (tracking)	30-193	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No comments at this time			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the house. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
12. Gammill, Cameron	87 Somerset Road	Addition	66-79	Emeritus
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
13. Koyote Realty Trust	68 Cliff Road (Lot B)	Revisions: cabana	30-67	Emeritus
Sitting	McLaughlin (acting chair), Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Williams			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Greg Phillips – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	Linda Williams , for 64 Cliff Road – No longer have objections.			
Concerns	(8:32) Staff - Read previous concerns from September 03.			
	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Leonardo-Finger)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60548	

14. Glenhurst West RT	137 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30-259	CWA
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chip Webster , Chip Webster Architecture – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. The building envelop is very small due to conservation restrictions. Ethan Griffin, Chip Webster Architecture Steven Cohen , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP – W elevation is blocked from Tuppency by another structure.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:35) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 17. Williams – Said the applicant is sticking with a band program and tweaking an alien design. Suggested starting with a new design. There are still massing issues; one side is 33 feet tall. Hill-Holdgate – The “D” windows would be an issue if they are visible. The chimneys are exterior of the roof line; they should be wrapped into the roof with more traditional tops. The west elevation windows in the dormers, okay with them being ganged but should be smaller with the cheek wall pulled in. Same on the east elevation dormers. The north elevation is most visible from the water; 2 nd floor deck to the right should have 1 door with 6-over-6 windows either side or two single doors separated more. The other side can be a single door with a 6-over-6 window. Would like the transoms to go but not sure they will be visible. It’s a large site set way back and visible mostly from the water and a little bit from Tuppency. The skirt should have 1½ inch gaps. McLaughlin – Structure is 78 feet long. North elevation middle door should be replaced with windows. Eliminate the transoms. Williams – Some of the windows are way too big. South elevation gable end “B” windows. West elevation is visible from Tuppency. Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate about the north elevation. French door panes need to match windows. The 1-story elements off the side don’t work as a closed porch.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
15. Fraker	12 Mt Vernon St – HSAB	Revisions	55.4.1-35	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Request this be held for Tuesday, November 12.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:55) No comments at this time.			
Motion	Held for November 12 due to lack of a quorum.			
Vote	N/A	Certificate #		
16. Seven Doors N. T.	13 Lincoln Avenue	Raise existing main house	30-135	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project; house and grade will come up 18 inches.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:57) Staff – Read previous concerns from October 22. Leonardo-Finger – Does not approve.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried 3-0/Leonardo-Finger abstain	Certificate #	60549	
17. Murray, John & Lynn	4 Mikes Drive	New dwelling	66-76	J. Murray
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

18. Taaffe, James	20 Boulevarde	Revisions: pool house	80-82	Thornewill
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

19. Dunning, John	5 N. Liberty St – HSAB	Move on-site, addition	42.3.4-7	Emeritus
-------------------	------------------------	------------------------	----------	----------

Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate
Alternates	None
Recused	None
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
Representing	None
Public	None
Concerns	No Quorum
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate #

20. 39 Hulbert LLC	39 Hulbert Avenue	New guest house	29-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

21. Bermington	6 Captains Lane	Revisions	30-619	W. Yost
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

22. Minella, Amy	8 Giny Lane	Revisions: hardscaping	41-842	W. Yost
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

23. Shuttleworth, Paul	112 Somerset Road	New dwelling	66-223	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	McLaughlin			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Submitted context documentation at the table.			
Representing	Doug Mills, BPC			
	Paul Shuttleworth			
Public	None			
Concerns	Staff – There is a request to hold for Thursday			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday, November 7. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate #			

24. Beardsley, Scott	138 Main Street – HSAB	Hardscaping	41-521	Edgewater Inc
----------------------	------------------------	-------------	--------	---------------

Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Leonardo-Finger, Camp
Alternates	None
Recused	None
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
Representing	None
Public	None
Concerns	None at this time.
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate #

25. Grimshaw, Gloria 2C Winn Street Rev: COA #58838 41-183 BPC
 Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Leonardo-Finger, Camp
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns None at this time.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)**
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate #**

26. Domboys R.T. 2B Winn Street Rev: COA #57657 41-183 BPC
 Sitting Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Leonardo-Finger, Camp
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns None at this time.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for Thursday November 7 due to lack of quorum. (Hill-Holdgate)**
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate #**

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

Approve Minutes	September 24 & 26 and October 1, 3, 10, 15 & 17 – Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate) Carried 3-0 /Williams abstain
Review Minutes	October 22, 24 & 29
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Status and clarification of 8 Milestone Road – Will require executive session. • Discussion of 86 Main Street opinion – Chair and Administrator should send letter to owner. Motion to allow the chair an administrator to craft a letter through Town Counsel to the owner of 86 Main Street. (Hill-Holdgate) Carried unanimously • Enforcement action on 11 Baxter Road, discussion on submission of RLS – Motion to submit an RLS about demo by neglect. (Leonardo-Finger) Carried unanimously • Establishment of the workgroup per 2012 Article 63 – Needs to be advertised and ratified. Motion to establish the work group and advertise. (Camp) Carried unanimously • Discussion on agenda/meeting composition: not segregating old/new business meetings. - Held • 8 North Water Street hardscaping: granite curbing in OHD – The chair asked commissioner to take a look at the curbing there; DPW installed linear white granite that HDC does not approve. Chair would like to establish a policy and talk to the DPW.
Commission Comments	Williams – 82 Main Street needs to be put on the agenda for discussion. Leonardo-Finger – the trash cans and bike racks need to be back on the agenda.

Motion to Adjourn: 9:11

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
 TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board